

# *Table of Contents*

## **Executive Summary**

---

### **1 Introduction**

---

1.1	Purpose and Scope of Study .....	1-1
1.2	WTC Site .....	1-2
1.3	Timeline and Event Summary .....	1-4
1.4	Response of the Engineering Community .....	1-8
1.4.1	Local Authorities .....	1-8
1.4.2	SEAO NY Participation .....	1-10
1.5	Overview of Building Codes and Fire Standards .....	1-15
1.5.1	Building Codes .....	1-15
1.5.2	Unusual Building Loads .....	1-16
1.5.3	Overview of Fire-Structure Interaction .....	1-17
1.5.3.1	ASTM E119 Standard Fire Test.....	1-18
1.5.3.2	Performance in Actual Building Fires.....	1-18
1.6	Report Organization .....	1-20
1.7	References .....	1-21

### **2 WTC 1 and WTC 2**

---

2.1	Building Descriptions .....	2-1
2.1.1	General.....	2-1
2.1.2	Structural Description .....	2-1
2.1.3	Fire Protection .....	2-11
2.1.3.1	Passive Protection .....	2-12
2.1.3.2	Suppression.....	2-12

---

*Table of Contents*

2.1.3.3	Smoke Management .....	2-13
2.1.3.4	Fire Department Features .....	2-13
2.1.4	Emergency Egress .....	2-13
2.1.5	Emergency Power .....	2-14
2.1.6	Management Procedures .....	2-14
2.2	Building Response .....	2-15
2.2.1	WTC 1 .....	2-15
2.2.1.1	Initial Damage From Aircraft Impact .....	2-15
2.2.1.2	Fire Development .....	2-21
2.2.1.3	Evacuation .....	2-24
2.2.1.4	Structural Response to Fire Loading .....	2-24
2.2.1.5	Progression of Collapse .....	2-27
2.2.2	WTC 2 .....	2-27
2.2.2.1	Initial Damage From Aircraft Impact .....	2-27
2.2.2.2	Preliminary Structural Analysis .....	2-32
2.2.2.3	Fire Development .....	2-34
2.2.2.4	Evacuation .....	2-35
2.2.2.5	Initiation of Collapse .....	2-35
2.2.2.6	Progression of Collapse .....	2-35
2.2.3	Substructure .....	2-35
2.3	Observations and Findings .....	2-36
2.4	Recommendations .....	2-39
2.5	References .....	2-40

---

### 3 WTC 3

3.1	Design and Construction Features .....	3-1
3.1.1	Project Overview .....	3-1
3.1.2	Building Description .....	3-1
3.1.3	Structural Description .....	3-2
3.2	1993 Attack .....	3-5
3.3	2001 Attacks .....	3-5
3.3.1	Fire and Evacuation .....	3-5
3.3.2	Building Response .....	3-6
3.4	Observations .....	3-8
3.5	Recommendations .....	3-8
3.5	References .....	3-8

---

**4 WTC 4, 5, and 6**

4.1	Design and Construction Features .....	4-1
4.1.1	Structural Design Features .....	4-1
4.1.2	Fire Protection Features .....	4-2
4.2	Building Loads and Performance .....	4-4
4.2.1	Impact Damage to WTC 5 .....	4-7
4.2.2	Fire Damage .....	4-9
4.3	Analysis of Building Performance .....	4-10
4.3.1	Steel and Frame Behavior .....	4-10
4.3.2	WTC 5 – Local Collapse Mechanisms .....	4-15
4.4	Observations and Findings .....	4-16
4.5	Recommendations .....	4-21
4.6	References .....	4-21

---

**5 WTC 7**

5.1	Introduction .....	5-1
5.2	Structural Description .....	5-3
5.2.1	Foundations .....	5-3
5.2.2	Structural Framing .....	5-4
5.2.3	Transfer Trusses and Girders .....	5-4
5.2.4	Connections .....	5-8
5.3	Fire Protection Systems .....	5-10
5.3.1	Egress Systems .....	5-10
5.3.2	Detection and Alarm .....	5-10
5.3.3	Compartmentalization .....	5-11
5.3.4	Suppression Systems .....	5-12
5.3.5	Power .....	5-13
5.4	Building Loads .....	5-13
5.5	Timeline of Events Affecting WTC 7 on September 11, 2001 .....	5-16
5.5.1	Collapse of WTC 2 .....	5-16
5.5.2	Collapse of WTC 1 .....	5-16
5.5.3	Fires at WTC 7 .....	5-20

---

*Table of Contents*

5.5.4 Sequence of WTC 7 Collapse .....	5-23
5.6 Potential Collapse Mechanism .....	5-24
5.6.1 Probable Collapse Initiation Events .....	5-24
5.6.2 Probable Collapse Sequence .....	5-30
5.7 Observations and Findings .....	5-31
5.8 Recommendations .....	5-32
5.9 References .....	5-32

---

**6 Bankers Trust Building**

6.1 Introduction .....	6-1
6.2 Building Description .....	6-1
6.3 Structural Damage Description .....	6-4
6.4 Architectural Damage Description .....	6-6
6.5 Fireproofing .....	6-10
6.6 Overall Assessment .....	6-10
6.7 Analysis .....	6-11
6.7.1 Key Assumptions .....	6-12
6.7.2 Model Refinement .....	6-12
6.7.3 Simulation of Nonlinear Behavior .....	6-13
6.7.4 Connection Details .....	6-13
6.7.5 Connection Behavior .....	6-14
6.8 Observations and Findings .....	6-15
6.9 Recommendations .....	6-16
6.10 References .....	6-16

---

**7 Peripheral Buildings**

7.1 Introduction .....	7-1
7.2 World Financial Center .....	7-4
7.2.1 The Winter Garden .....	7-4
7.2.2 WFC 3, American Express Building .....	7-5
7.3 Verizon Building .....	7-7
7.4 30 West Broadway .....	7-13

7.5	130 Cedar Street .....	7-14
7.6	90 West Street .....	7-15
7.7	45 Park Place .....	7-17
7.8	One Liberty Plaza .....	7-17
7.9	Observations and Findings .....	7-19
7.10	Recommendations .....	7-19
7.11	References .....	7-19

## **8 Observations, Findings, and Recommendations**

---

8.1	Summary of Report Observations, Findings, and Recommendations .....	8-1
8.2	Chapter Observations, Findings, and Recommendations .....	8-2
8.2.1	Chapter 1: Building Codes and Fire Standards .....	8-2
8.2.2	Chapter 2: WTC 1 and WTC 2 .....	8-2
8.2.2.1	Observations and Findings .....	8-2
8.2.2.2	Recommendations .....	8-5
8.2.3	Chapter 3: WTC 3 .....	8-6
8.2.3.1	Observations .....	8-6
8.2.3.2	Recommendations .....	8-6
8.2.4	Chapter 4: WTC 4, 5, and 6 .....	8-6
8.2.4.1	Observations and Findings .....	8-6
8.2.4.2	Recommendations .....	8-7
8.2.5	Chapter 5: WTC 7 .....	8-7
8.2.5.1	Observations and Findings .....	8-7
8.2.5.2	Recommendations .....	8-8
8.2.6	Chapter 6: Bankers Trust .....	8-8
8.2.6.1	Observations and Findings .....	8-8
8.2.6.2	Recommendations .....	8-9
8.2.7	Chapter 7: Peripheral Buildings .....	8-10
8.2.7.1	Observations and Findings .....	8-10
8.2.7.2	Recommendations .....	8-10
8.2.8	Appendix C: Limited Metallurgical Examination .....	8-10
8.2.8.1	Observations and Findings .....	8-10
8.2.8.2	Recommendations .....	8-11
8.3	Building Performance Study Recommendations for Future Study .....	8-11
8.3.1	National Response .....	8-11
8.3.2	Interaction of Structural Elements and Fire .....	8-11
8.3.3	Interaction of Professions in Design .....	8-12

---

*Table of Contents*

8.3.4	Fire Protection Engineering Discipline .....	8-12
8.3.5	Building Evacuation .....	8-12
8.3.6	Emergency Personnel .....	8-12
8.3.7	Education of Stakeholders .....	8-13
8.3.8	Study Process .....	8-13
8.3.9	Archival Information .....	8-13
8.3.10	SEAoNY Structural Engineering Emergency Response Plan .....	8-13

---

**A Overview of Fire Protection in Buildings**

A.1	Introduction .....	A-1
A.2	Fire Behavior .....	A-1
A.2.1	Burning Behavior of Materials .....	A-1
A.2.2	Stages of Fire Development .....	A-4
A.2.3	Behavior of Fully Developed Fires .....	A-4
A.3	Structural Response to Fire .....	A-5
A.3.1	Effect of Fire on Steel .....	A-5
A.3.1.1	Introduction .....	A-5
A.3.1.2	Evaluating Fire Resistance .....	A-6
A.3.1.3	Response of High-rise, Steel-frame Buildings in Previous Fire Incidents .....	A-9
A.3.1.4	Properties of Steel .....	A-10
A.3.1.5	Fire Protection Techniques for Steel .....	A-14
A.3.1.6	Temperature Rise in Steel .....	A-14
A.3.1.7	Factors Affecting Performance of Steel Structures in Fire .....	A-17
A.3.2	Effect of Fire on Concrete .....	A-19
A.3.2.1	General .....	A-19
A.3.2.2	Properties of Lightweight Concrete .....	A-19
A.3.3	Fire and Structural Modeling .....	A-22
A.4	Life Safety .....	A-23
A.4.1	Evacuation Process .....	A-24
A.4.2	Analysis .....	A-24
A.5	References .....	A-26

---

**B Structural Steel and Steel Connections**

B.1	Structural Steel .....	B-1
B.2	Mechanical Properties .....	B-2

B.3	WTC 1 and WTC 2 Connection Capacity.....	B-4
B.3.1	Background .....	B-4
B.3.2	Observations.....	B-5
B.3.3	Connectors .....	B-5
B.4	Examples of WTC 1 and WTC 2 Connection Capacity .....	B-7
B.4.1	Bolted Column End Plates .....	B-7
B.4.2	Bolted Spandrel Connections .....	B-8
B.4.3	Floor Truss Seated End Connections at Spandrel Beam and Core .....	B-9
B.4.4	WTC 5 Column-tree Shear Connections .....	B-12
B.5	References .....	B-14

---

## C Limited Metallurgical Examination

C.1	Introduction .....	C-1
C.2	Sample 1 (From WTC 7) .....	C-1
C.3	Summary for Sample 1 .....	C-5
C.4	Sample 2 (From WTC 1 or WTC 2) .....	C-5
C.5	Summary for Sample 2 .....	C-13
C.6	Suggestions for Future Research .....	C-13

---

## D WTC Steel Data Collection

D.1	Introduction .....	D-1
D.2	Project Background .....	D-1
D.3	Methods .....	D-2
D.3.1	Identifying and Saving Pieces .....	D-2
D.3.2	Documenting Pieces .....	D-5
D.3.3	Getting Coupons .....	D-8
D.4	Data Collected .....	D-10
D.5	Conclusions and Future Work .....	D-13
D.6	References .....	D-13

---

## E Aircraft Information

General Specifications.....	E-1
-----------------------------	-----

---

## *Table of Contents*

---

### **F Structural Engineers Emergency Response Plan**

---

### **G Acknowledgments**

---

### **H Acronyms and Abbreviations**

---

### **I Metric Conversions**

---

### **Tables**

---

Table 1.1	Timeline of Major Events .....	1-10
Table 2.1	Estimated Openings in Exterior Walls of WTC 1 .....	2-23
Table 5.1	WTC 7 Tenants .....	5-2
Table 5.2	WTC 7 Fuel Distribution Systems .....	5-14
Table 7.1	DoB/SEAoNY Cooperative Building Damage Assessment – November 7, 2001 .....	7-3
Table A.1	Peak Heat Release Rates of Various Materials (NFPA 92B and NFPA 72) .....	A-3
Table A.2	Fire Duration in Previous Fire Incidents in Steel-frame Buildings .....	A-10
Table A.3	Critical Temperatures for Various Types of Steel .....	A-15
Table A.4	Test Methods for Spray-applied Fireproofing Materials .....	A-18

### **Figures**

---

#### **Chapter 1**

Figure 1-1	WTC site map. ....	1-3
Figure 1-2	Approximate flight paths of aircraft. ....	1-5
Figure 1-3	WTC impact locations and resulting fireballs. ....	1-5
Figure 1-4	Areas of aircraft debris impact. ....	1-6
Figure 1-5	Fireball erupts on the north face of WTC 2 as United Airlines Flight 175 strikes the building. ....	1-7
Figure 1-6	View of the north and east faces showing fire and impact damage to both towers. ....	1-7
Figure 1-7	Schematic depiction of areas of collapse debris impact, based on aerial photographs and documented damage. ....	1-9
Figure 1-8	Seismic recordings on east-west component at Palisades, NY, for events at WTC on September 11, 2001, distance 34 km. ....	1-11

Figure 1-9A Satellite photograph of the WTC site taken before the attacks. ....	1-12
Figure 1-9B Satellite photograph of the WTC site taken after the attacks. ....	1-13
Figure 1-10 Comparison of high-rise building and aircraft sizes. ....	1-19

## Chapter 2

Figure 2-1 Representative floor plan (based on floor plan for 94th and 95th floors of WTC 1). ....	2-2
Figure 2-2 Representative structural framing plan, upper floors. ....	2-4
Figure 2-3 Partial elevation of exterior bearing-wall frame showing exterior wall module construction. ....	2-6
Figure 2-4 Base of exterior wall frame. ....	2-7
Figure 2-5 Structural tube frame behavior. ....	2-7
Figure 2-6 Floor truss member with detail of end connection. ....	2-8
Figure 2-7 Erection of prefabricated components, forming exterior wall and floor deck units. ....	2-9
Figure 2-8 Erection of floor framing during original construction. ....	2-9
Figure 2-9 Cross-section through typical floor trusses, showing transverse truss. ....	2-9
Figure 2-10 Outrigger truss system at tower roof. ....	2-10
Figure 2-11 Location of subterranean structure. ....	2-11
Figure 2-12 Floor plan of 94th and 95th floors of WTC 1 showing egress stairways. ....	2-14
Figure 2-13 Zone of aircraft impact on the north face of WTC 1. ....	2-16
Figure 2-14 Approximate zone of impact of aircraft on the north face of WTC 1. ....	2-17
Figure 2-15 Impact damage to the north face of WTC 1. ....	2-18
Figure 2-16 Impact damage to exterior columns on the north face of WTC 1. ....	2-18
Figure 2-17 Approximate debris location on the 91st floor of WTC 1. ....	2-19
Figure 2-18 Landing gear found at the corner of West and Rector Streets ....	2-19
Figure 2-19 Redistribution of load after aircraft impact. ....	2-20
Figure 2-20 Expansion of floor slabs and framing results in outward deflection of columns and potential overload. ....	2-25
Figure 2-21 Buckling of columns initiated by failure of floor joist connections. ....	2-26
Figure 2-22 Catenary action of floor joists on several floors initiates column buckling failures. ....	2-26
Figure 2-23 Aerial photograph of the WTC site after September 11 attack showing adjacent buildings damaged by debris from the collapse of WTC 1. ....	2-28

---

## *Table of Contents*

---

Figure 2-24	Southeast corner of WTC 2 shortly after aircraft impact. ....	2-28
Figure 2-25	Approximate zone of impact of aircraft on the south face of WTC 2. ....	2-29
Figure 2-26	Impact damage to the south face of WTC 2. ....	2-30
Figure 2-27	Impact damage to exterior columns on the south face of WTC 2. ....	2-30
Figure 2-28	Conflagration and debris exiting the north wall of WTC 2, behind WTC 1. ....	2-31
Figure 2-29	A portion of the fuselage of United Airlines Flight 175 on the roof of WTC 5. ....	2-32
Figure 2-30	North face of WTC 2 opposite the zone of impact on the south face, behind WTC 1.....	2-33
Figure 2-31	Plot of column utilization ratio at the 80th floor of WTC 2, viewed looking outward. ....	2-34
Figure 2-32	The top portion of WTC 2 falls to the east, then south, as viewed from the northeast. ....	2-36
Figure 2-33	Damage to substructure slabs caused by collapses of WTC 1 and WTC 2. ....	2-36

## **Chapter 3**

Figure 3-1	Developed north and west elevations. ....	3-2
Figure 3-2	Developed south and east elevations. ....	3-2
Figure 3-3	Typical hotel floor plan. ....	3-3
Figure 3-4	Typical hotel floor framing plan. ....	3-4
Figure 3-5	Typical transverse bracing elevation. ....	3-5
Figure 3-6	Exterior columns from WTC 2 collapse falling on the southern part of WTC 3. ....	3-6
Figure 3-7	Partial collapse of WTC 3 after collapse of WTC 2. ....	3-7
Figure 3-8	Remains of WTC 3 after collapse of WTC 1 and WTC 2. ....	3-8

## **Chapter 4**

Figure 4-1	Typical floor plan for WTC 5. ....	4-2
Figure 4-2	Typical column-tree system (not to scale). ....	4-3
Figure 4-3	Typical interior bay framing in WTC 5. ....	4-3
Figure 4-4	Stairway enclosure core locations in WTC 5. ....	4-4
Figure 4-5	Damage to WTC 4.....	4-5
Figure 4-6	Damage to WTC 5.....	4-5
Figure 4-7	Approximate locations of damaged floor areas of WTC 5. ....	4-6
Figure 4-8	Damage to WTC 6.....	4-8
Figure 4-9	Impact damage to WTC 6. ....	4-8

Figure 4-10	Impact damage to the exterior façade of WTC 6 .....	4-9
Figure 4-11	WTC 5 façade damage. ....	4-10
Figure 4-12	Impact damage to WTC 5 .....	4-11
Figure 4-13	WTC 5 on fire. ....	4-13
Figure 4-14	Deformed beams in WTC 5. ....	4-13
Figure 4-15	Unburned bookstore in WTC 5. ....	4-14
Figure 4-16	Looking through the door into the undamaged stair tower in WTC 5. ....	4-14
Figure 4-17	Buckled beam flange and column on the 8th floor of WTC 5 that was weakened by fire. ....	4-15
Figure 4-18	Internal collapsed area in WTC 5. ....	4-16
Figure 4-19	Internal collapsed area in WTC 5. ....	4-17
Figure 4-20	Internal collapsed area in WTC 5. ....	4-18
Figure 4-21	Internal collapsed area in WTC 5 with closeup of connection failure at column tree. ....	4-18
Figure 4-22	Connection samples. ....	4-19

## Chapter 5

Figure 5-1	Foundation plan – WTC 7. ....	5-3
Figure 5-2	Plan view of typical floor framing. ....	5-4
Figure 5-3	Elevations of building and core area. ....	5-5
Figure 5-4	Fifth floor diaphragm plan showing T-sections imbedded in 14-inch slab. ....	5-6
Figure 5-5	3-D diagram showing relations of trusses and transfer girders. ....	5-6
Figure 5-6	Seventh floor plan showing locations of transfer trusses and girders. ....	5-7
Figure 5-7	Truss 1 detail. ....	5-8
Figure 5-8	Truss 2 detail. ....	5-9
Figure 5-9	Truss 3 detail. ....	5-10
Figure 5-10	Cantilever transfer girder detail. ....	5-11
Figure 5-11	Compartmentalization provided by concrete floor slabs. ....	5-12
Figure 5-12	Sequence of debris generated by collapses of WTC 2, 1, and 7. ....	5-17
Figure 5-13	Pedestrian bridge (bottom center) still standing after WTC 2 has collapsed, sending substantial dust and debris onto the street, but before WTC 1 (top center) has collapsed. ....	5-18
Figure 5-14	View from the north of the WTC 1 collapse and spread of debris around WTC 7. ....	5-18

---

*Table of Contents*

Figure 5-15	Debris from the collapse of WTC 1 located between WTC 7 and the Verizon building. ....	5-19
Figure 5-16	Damage to the southeast corner of WTC 7, looking from West Street. ....	5-19
Figure 5-17	Building damage to the southwest corner and smoke plume from south face of WTC 7, looking from the World Financial Plaza. ....	5-20
Figure 5-18	WTC 7, with a large volume of dark smoke rising from it, just visible behind WFC 1 (left). ....	5-21
Figure 5-19	Fires on the 11th and 12th floors of the east face of WTC 7. ....	5-22
Figure 5-20	View from the north of WTC 7 with both mechanical penthouses intact. ....	5-24
Figure 5-21	East mechanical penthouse collapsed. ....	5-25
Figure 5-22	East and now west mechanical penthouses gone. ....	5-25
Figure 5-23	View from the north of the “kink” or fault developing in WTC 7. ....	5-26
Figure 5-24	Areas of potential transfer truss failure. ....	5-27
Figure 5-25	Debris cloud from collapse of WTC 7. ....	5-27
Figure 5-26	Debris generated after collapse of WTC 7. ....	5-28

**Chapter 6**

Figure 6-1	North face of Bankers Trust building with impact damage between floors 8 and 23. ....	6-1
Figure 6-2	Closeup of area of partial collapse. ....	6-2
Figure 6-3	Floor plan above the 2nd level (ground floor extension not shown). ....	6-3
Figure 6-4	Area of initial impact of debris at the 23rd floor. ....	6-4
Figure 6-5	Approximate zones of damage – 19th through 22nd floors, 16th through 18th floors, 11th through 15th floors, and 9th through 10th floors. ....	6-5
Figure 6-6	Moment-connected beams to columns. ....	6-7
Figure 6-7	Column with the remains of two moment connections. ....	6-7
Figure 6-8	Failed shear connection of beam web to column web. ....	6-8
Figure 6-9	Suspended column D-8 at the 15th floor. ....	6-8
Figure 6-10	Area of collapsed floor slab in bays between C-8, E-8, C-7, and E-7, from 15th floor. ....	6-9
Figure 6-11	Bankers Trust lobby (note debris has been swept into piles). ....	6-9
Figure 6-12	Office at north side of the 8th floor. ....	6-10
Figure 6-13	3-D ANSYS model of flange and shear plate moment connection. ....	6-14
Figure 6-14	3-D ANSYS model of flange and seat moment connection. ....	6-14

## Chapter 7

Figure 7-1	New York City DDC/DoB Cooperative Building Damage Assessment Map of November 7, 2001 (based on SEAoNY inspections).....	7-2
Figure 7-2	Southeast corner of WFC 3.....	7-5
Figure 7-3	View of Winter Garden damage from West Street, with WTC 1 debris in front of WFC 2.....	7-6
Figure 7-4	View of Winter Garden damage from West Street, with WTC 1 debris leaning against WFC 3.....	7-6
Figure 7-5	Interior damage at floor 20 of WFC 3.....	7-7
Figure 7-6	Verizon building – damage to east elevation (Washington Street).....	7-8
Figure 7-7	Verizon building – damage to east elevation (Washington Street) due to WTC 7 framing leaning against the building.....	7-9
Figure 7-8	Verizon building – damage to east elevation (Washington Street).....	7-9
Figure 7-9	Verizon building – column damage on east elevation (Washington Street).....	7-10
Figure 7-10	Verizon building – damage to south elevation (Vesey Street).....	7-11
Figure 7-11	Verizon building – localized damage to south elevation (Vesey Street).....	7-11
Figure 7-12	Verizon building – detail of damage to south elevation (Vesey Street).....	7-12
Figure 7-13	30 West Broadway – south façade, 6th floor to roof, looking northeast.....	7-13
Figure 7-14	130 Cedar Street and 90 West Street.....	7-14
Figure 7-15	Interior of 90 West Street showing typical construction features.....	7-16
Figure 7-16	Buckling damage at top of column on floor 8 of 90 West Street.....	7-17
Figure 7-17	Buckling damage at top of column on floor 23 of 90 West Street.....	7-18
Figure 7-18	One Liberty Plaza – south elevation, lower floors.....	7-19
Figure 7-19	One Liberty Plaza – south elevation, upper floors.....	7-20

## Appendix A

Figure A-1	Heat release rate for office module.....	A-2
Figure A-2	Fire growth rates (the SFPE Handbook of Fire Protection Engineering).....	A-3
Figure A-3	Comparison of exposure temperatures in standard tests.....	A-6
Figure A-4	Thermal properties of steel at elevated temperatures.....	A-11
Figure A-5	Stress-strain curves for structural steel (ASTM A36) at a range of temperatures.....	A-11
Figure A-6	Strength of steel at elevated temperatures.....	A-12

---

*Table of Contents*

Figure A-7	Modulus of elasticity at elevated temperatures for structural steels and steel reinforcing bars. ....	A-13
Figure A-8	Reduction of the yield strength of cold-formed light-gauge steel at elevated temperatures. ....	A-13
Figure A-9	Steel temperature rise due to fire exposure for unprotected steel column. ....	A-16
Figure A-10	Steel temperature rise due to fire exposure for steel column protected with 1 inch of spray-applied fireproofing. ....	A-16
Figure A-11	The effect of temperature on the modulus of elasticity strength of different types of concretes (Kodur and Harmathy 2002) ....	A-20
Figure A-12	Reduction of the compressive strength of two lightweight concretes (one with natural sand) at elevated temperatures (Kodur and Harmathy 2002). ....	A-21
Figure A-13	Usual ranges of variation for the volume-specific heat of normal-weight and lightweight concretes (Kodur and Harmathy 2002). ....	A-21
Figure A-14	Specific flow rate as a function of density (SPFE Handbook of Fire Protection Engineering). ....	A-25
Figure A-15	Estimated evacuation times for high-rise buildings. ....	A-26

## Appendix B

Figure B-1	Exterior column end plates. ....	B-1
Figure B-2	Tensile stress-strain curves for three ASTM-designation steels (Brockenbrough and Johnston 1968, Tall 1974). ....	B-3
Figure B-3	Expanded yield portion of the tensile stress-strain curves (Tall 1974). ....	B-3
Figure B-4	Effect of high strain rate on shape of stress-strain diagram (Tall 1974). ....	B-4
Figure B-5	Column tree showing bolt bearing shear failures of spandrel connection. ....	B-6
Figure B-6	Shear fracture failure of fillet welds connecting a W-shape column to a box core column. ....	B-7
Figure B-7	Bent and fractured bolts at a column four-bolt connection. ....	B-8
Figure B-8	Typical truss top chord connections to column/spandrel beam and to the core beam. ....	B-10
Figure B-9	(A) Visco-elastic damper angles bolted to angle welded to spandrel plate and (B) failed bearing seat connection . ....	B-11
Figure B-10	(A) Bracket plate welded to the column/spandrel plate and (B) horizontal plate brace with shear connectors welded to the failed bracket. ....	B-11
Figure B-11	Shear failure of floor joist connections from column/spandrel plate. ....	B-12

**Appendix C**

Figure C-1	Eroded A36 wide-flange beam. ....	C-1
Figure C-2	Closeup view of eroded wide-flange beam section. ....	C-2
Figure C-3	Mounted and polished severely thinned section removed from the wide-flange beam shown in Figure C-1. ....	C-2
Figure C-4	Optical microstructure near the steel surface. ....	C-3
Figure C-5	Another hot corrosion region near the steel surface (etched with 4 percent nital). ....	C-3
Figure C-6	Microstructure of A36 steel. ....	C-4
Figure C-7	Deep penetration of liquid into the steel. ....	C-4
Figure C-8	Qualitative chemical analysis. ....	C-5
Figure C-9	Qualitative chemical analysis. ....	C-6
Figure C-10	Grain boundary corrosion attack. ....	C-6
Figure C-11	Microstructure of a typical region showing the surface and grain boundary corrosion attack of Sample 2. ....	C-7
Figure C-12	Higher magnification of the region shown in Figure C-10. ....	C-7
Figure C-13	Regions where chemical analysis was performed. ....	C-8
Figure C-14	Gradient of sulfides into the steel from the oxide-metal interface. ....	C-12

**Appendix D**

Figure D-1	Mixed, unsorted steel upon delivery to salvage yard. ....	D-2
Figure D-2	Torch cutting of very large pieces into more manageable pieces of a few tons each. ....	D-3
Figure D-3	Pile of unsorted mixed steel, with sorted, large steel pieces being lifted and cut into smaller pieces. ....	D-3
Figure D-4	Engineer climbing in unprocessed steel pile to inspect and mark promising pieces .....	D-4
Figure D-5	Stenciled markings on WTC 2 perimeter column from floors 68-71. ....	D-5
Figure D-6	Steel pieces marked "SAVE." ....	D-6
Figure D-7	Engineers measuring and recording steel piece dimensions. ....	D-6
Figure D-8	Engineer measuring spandrel plate thickness ( $t_s$ ). ....	D-7
Figure D-9	Measurement of 1/4 inch for web thickness ( $t_w$ ). ....	D-7
Figure D-10	Measured dimensions of the steel pieces. ....	D-8
Figure D-11	Burnt steel piece marked for cutting of coupon. ....	D-9
Figure D-12	Coupon cut from WTC 5 showing web tear-out at bolts. ....	D-9
Figure D-13	WTC 1 or WTC 2 core column (C-74). ....	D-10

---

*Table of Contents*

Figure D-14	WTC 7 W14 column tree with beams attached to two floors.	D-11
Figure D-15	Built-up member with failure along stitch welding.....	D-11
Figure D-16	Engineer inspecting fire damage of perimeter column tree from WTC 1 or WTC 2.....	D-12
Figure D-17	Seat-connected in fire-damaged W14 column from WTC 7.	D-12
Figure D-18	WTC 1 or WTC 2 floor-truss section with seat connection fractured along welds.	D-13